

# CSR Strategies and Guidelines for MSMEs: A Review of Micro, Small, and Medium Enterprises' Sustainable CSR Practices

Yuni Nustini\*  
Islamic University of Indonesia

Agus Arwani  
Islamic University of Indonesia

Eva Budiana  
Islamic University of Indonesia

Maidani  
Doctorate Program in Economics, Islamic University of Indonesia

Sri Dewi Wahyundaru  
Doctorate Program in Economics, Islamic University of Indonesia

Randy Ariyadita Putra  
Doctorate Program in Economics, Islamic University of Indonesia

— *Review of* —  
**Integrative  
Business &  
Economics**  
— *Research* —

## ABSTRACT

This study embarks on a comprehensive literature review to explore the nuances of corporate social responsibility (CSR) within micro, small, and medium enterprises (MSMEs), recognizing their critical role in global economies and practices empirically. It aims to bridge the knowledge gap by delving into CSR practices specific to MSMEs, pinpointing the unique challenges they encounter in adopting CSR and evaluating the potential benefits of these practices. Employing meticulous and systematic research methodologies, this study gathered, analyzed, and synthesized the existing literature on CSR in the MSME sector. This research underscores the significance of CSR in MSMEs, acknowledging the constraints posed by limited data and the need for context-specific solutions. It also sheds light on the theoretical and practical implications of this study for formulating effective CSR strategies and guidelines tailored to MSMEs. Moreover, this study highlights critical areas where targeted support, such as marketing aid, training, and mentorship by donor agencies, can substantially improve MSME sustainability. A primary recommendation is for these agencies to perform comprehensive needs assessments for MSMEs before extending assistance, ensuring that support is customized and optimally beneficial to each enterprise's unique circumstances.

Keywords: SLR, CSR, Strategies, MSMEs.

Received 18 November 2023 | Revised 10 March 2024 | Accepted 11 April 2024.

## 1. INTRODUCTION

Amid the evolving global economic landscape, the concept of Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) has drawn heightened interest, as evidenced by previous studies (Luetkenhorst, 2004); (ElAlfy *et al.*, 2020). CSR embodies the recognition that organizations bear responsibility for the social and environmental consequences of their business activities (Lindgreen *et al.*, 2009). Although commonly associated with large corporations, the role of Micro, Small, and Medium Enterprises (MSMEs) in embracing and implementing CSR practices is gaining increasing acknowledgment (Russo and Tencati, 2009).

Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) has emerged as a pivotal concept in contemporary business, underscoring the imperative for organizations to be cognizant of the societal and environmental ramifications of their operations (Carroll, 2010). A key objective of companies to disclose their CSR initiatives is to bolster investor trust. This transparency assures investors lower risks associated with environmental litigation, thereby fostering a sense of investment security. Furthermore, robust CSR disclosures are often indicative of a company's resilience and financial robustness, as they suggest the capacity to generate sufficient revenue to support CSR endeavors, which in turn positively reflects investor welfare (Palupi. A, 2023).

While CSR is often associated with large corporations, its relevance and implications for Micro, Small, and Medium Enterprises (MSMEs) are also interesting for discussion. Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) in Micro, Small, and Medium Enterprises (MSMEs) is an increasingly prominent part of today's business landscape. In the context of MSMEs, CSR is a conscious effort to integrate social, environmental, and economic considerations into daily activities (Ibrahim *et al.*, 2012); (Achi, 2022).

Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) has become a crucial element in the contemporary business world, especially for Micro, Small, and Medium Enterprises (MSMEs) (Bhinekawati, 2018); (Achi (2022)). The significance of CSR in MSMEs extends beyond compliance with social and environmental standards. They play a pivotal role in driving sustainable growth and have a positive impact on society. CSR in the context of MSMEs is not solely about adhering to established norms; it also involves the development of businesses that offer broader and more sustainable benefits. Through the implementation of CSR practices, MSMEs have the opportunity to shape the future of their communities, the environment, and the broader economy, a perspective that echoed (Hernández-Perlins, 2016).

This study presents an in-depth analysis of the latest developments in Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) in Micro, Small, and Medium Enterprises (MSMEs). Given the vital role of MSMEs in the global economy, not only as key drivers of economic growth, but also as hubs of innovation, this research is of paramount importance. The integration of CSR practices into MSME operations is becoming increasingly relevant in today's rapidly evolving business world, highlighting the necessity for sustainability and social responsibility. Despite the growing prominence of CSR in global business discourse, there remains a notable paucity of research that specifically focuses on its application in MSMEs. Previous studies have predominantly concentrated on larger corporations, often neglecting the unique challenges and opportunities that CSR presents to MSMEs. This gap is further widened by existing research limitations, including a lack of comprehensive analysis of the challenges faced by MSMEs in implementing CSR and the data constraints that hinder the extrapolation of these findings.

The research findings indicate that, to realize sustainable Micro, Small, and Medium Enterprises (MSMEs), it is essential to link sustainable practices with overall business performance. Additionally, MSMEs can achieve a competitive edge through

enhanced collaboration with a variety of stakeholders, and by having a foundation in education supported by a robust institutional environment.

This research endeavors to bridge the existing gaps by delving into the intricacies of CSR practices within MSMEs. It aims to pinpoint the unique challenges that MSMEs encounter in embracing CSR and evaluate the potential benefits they can reap from its implementation. Moreover, this study scrutinizes both theoretical and practical ramifications to formulate CSR strategies and guidelines tailored for MSMEs. It investigates CSR approaches within the manufacturing and service sectors of MSMEs by examining both the internal and external elements that contribute to their efficacy. This inquiry extends to the impact on brand image and reputation and probes into the correlation between CSR and the financial performance and growth of MSMEs. Additionally, this research highlights the involvement of business owners in social and environmental initiatives, the role of governmental support, and the dynamics of collaboration with suppliers and customers. The anticipated outcomes of this study promise to make significant contributions to both practical applications and academic discourse. Empirically, the ultimate goal of these types of support is to create business sustainability for Micro, Small, and Medium Enterprises (MSMEs). However, Maitreyee et al. (2020) indicate that in the case of MSMEs, the situation differs significantly from that of larger companies. Social and environmental sustainability practices are often neglected in MSMEs, particularly those operating in emerging market countries. By contrast, for larger corporations, these sustainability practices are already considered a guideline in their business activities.

The distinctiveness of this study lies in its focus on Micro, Small, and Medium Enterprises (MSMEs), a sector that has hitherto received limited attention in Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) research. This study endeavors to amalgamate the most recent and pertinent findings from the CSR literature, aiming to offer a more holistic and up-to-date perspective on the subject. This research is anticipated to yield valuable insights for business practitioners, policymakers, and other stakeholders who are keen to foster CSR within the MSME context. Moreover, this study lays the foundation for subsequent research in this area.

Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) plays a pivotal role in fostering positive outcomes across social, environmental, and economic dimensions, particularly for micro-, small-, and medium-sized enterprises (MSMEs). Effective CSR practices not only bolster the reputation of MSMEs but also contribute significantly to creating a more sustainable society. The essence of CSR in MSMEs transcends mere compliance with established norms and involves forging a sustainable and positive impact on diverse facets of life. By embedding CSR practices into their everyday operations, MSMEs can contribute significantly to the construction of a more resilient and sustainable society.

The research will be structured into several points, including literature collection, analysis of findings, identification of challenges and benefits, and formulation of future research directions. This research is structured logically to provide a thorough understanding of CSR practices in MSMEs.

## **2 LITERATURE REVIEW**

### **2.1 Definition of CSR**

According to The World Business Council for Sustainable Development (Kossovsky, 2013) (WBCSD), CSR is "The continuing commitment by business to behave ethically and contribute to economic development while improving the quality of life of the workforce and their families as well as of the local community and society at large."

Carroll, A. B (2010) considers CSR as a multi-layered concept, which can be divided into four levels of interrelated aspects: (1) Economic responsibility, that the company should do business at least to cover its daily costs. (2) The legal responsibility that companies must not engage in illegal activities and must comply with statutory provisions. (3) Ethical responsibility describes the need for a company to act in a fair and ethical manner. (4) The fourth level is called philanthropic responsibility, which describes the company's creative community involvement to society's expectations (Shah, A. *et al.*, 2020)

## 2.2 Definition of MSMEs

Micro, Small, and Medium Enterprises (MSMEs) are used to describe a business sector with a smaller scale of operations than large enterprises (Suminah *et al.*, 2022). The definition of MSMEs is often based on several parameters, such as the number of employees, amount of assets, and annual revenue (Zaridis and Mousiolis, 2014). These parameters may vary from country to country according to local economic and industrial conditions.

Moreover, MSMEs are organizations with independent ownership and management structures, have a smaller scale, and are generally involved in producing, distributing, and marketing goods and services (Knight and Liesch, 2016). According to the World Bank, MSMEs are businesses with a smaller scale of operations than large enterprises and have a limited number of employees, revenue, and assets (Esubalew and Raghurama, 2017). Edward Elgar Publishing wrote that MSMEs are businesses that employ a small number of workers, have limited assets, and are generally more associated with local markets than with global markets (Spence *et al.*, 2018). The definitions of MSMEs used in this study may vary according to the definitions applied by papers and authors.

## 3. METHOD

The Systematic Literature Review (SLR) method is used to identify, review, and combine findings from various relevant studies in a particular field (van Dinter *et al.*, 2021). In this study, SLR CSR was conducted on MSMEs.

In this study, the stages of the SLR were determined as follows:

- Determine the research question
- The research questions regarding CSR SLR in MSMEs are as follows:
  - Q1: How do CSR implementation strategies differ among MSMEs in the manufacturing and service sectors?
  - Q2: What internal and external factors influence the successful Implementation of CSR practices in MSMEs?
  - Q3: What are the positive and negative impacts of CSR practices on the brand image and reputation?
  - Q4: What is the effect of CSR practices on the financial performance and growth?
  - Q5: Does the involvement of MSME owners in social and environmental activities affect business sustainability?
  - Q6: What role does government support play in encouraging the Implementation of CSR practices in MSMEs?
  - Q7: How does cooperation between suppliers and customers affect the Implementation of CSR practices in MSMEs?
- Database Selection:

- Academic databases and relevant sources of information related to CSR in MSMEs were obtained from Scopus.
- Keyword Selection
- Identify keywords that match this research with the keywords "CSR," "MSME," "CSR Practices," and "CSR Impact,"
- Literature Search
- Search using keywords specified in the Scopus database from 1997 to 2023. The search results were saved in a spreadsheet or Mendelley reference management tool, totaling 203 articles sourced from journals, reviews, and conferences.
- Literature Selection and Assessment
- Evaluation and selection of literature was based on predetermined inclusion and exclusion criteria. Select relevant and high-quality articles by removing articles from reviews and conferences, removing articles that are not on the topic with SLR, and selecting themes that are most suitable for the SLR object, namely SLR in MSMEs, and found a total of nine articles and other articles used as other sources of explanation.

In addition to the Systematic Literature Review (SLR) and Empirical Method involving interviews with donor agencies at two banks, namely Bank A and Bank B, as well as with four MSMEs to represent this study, there are, however, several limitations that may affect the outcomes.

## 4. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

### 4.1 Data description

Table 1 Article Data on General CSR Topics in the Scopus Database

Article Type	Total	Percentage
Article	170	84%
Review	19	9 %
Conference Paper	11	5 %
Book Chapter	3	1 %
Total	203	100 %

From Table 1, it can be seen that in the Scopus database, there are many topics on CSR in general within the scope of companies, banks, and SMEs, totaling 203 articles in the form of articles, reviews, conference papers, and book chapters, consisting of 170 articles or 84%, 19 in the form of reviews or 9%, 11 conference papers or 5%, and 3 book chapters or 1%. For SLR specifications, we narrow down the special SLR on the topic of CSR MSMEs. The search yielded the following results:

Table 2 Data on CSR MSME Topic Articles in the Scopus Database

Article Type	Total	Percentage
Article	9	69%
Review	1	7 %
Book Chapter	3	23 %
Total	13	100 %

Table 2 shows that the total number of articles, reviews, and book chapters related to CSR MSMEs was 13, consisting of nine articles (69 %), one review (7 %), and three

book chapters (23%). With these data, it will be interesting to contribute to further research on the topic of CSR MSMEs.

Table 3 of Articles with CSR MSME Topics

Author	Title	Year	Journal
J.P. Sánchez-Infante Hernández	Moderating effect of firm size on the influence of corporate social responsibility in the economic performance of micro-, small- and medium-sized enterprises	2020	Technological Forecasting and Social Change
A. Achi	CSR and green process innovation as antecedents of micro, small, and medium enterprise performance: The moderating role of perceived environmental volatility	2022	Journal of Business Research
F. Hernández-Perlines	Analysis of the effect of corporate social responsibility on the business results of micro, small, and medium-sized enterprises (MSMEs)	2016	Journal of Globalization, Competitiveness, and Governability
B. Jatmiko	Strategies for MSMEs to Achieve Sustainable Competitive Advantage: The SWOT Analysis Method	2021	Journal of Asian Finance, Economics and Business
J.L.E. Aguilar	Practices of corporate social responsibility developed by Mexican family businesses and their impact on competitive success and innovation	2019	Tec Empresarial
D. Wielgórka	Environmental management in the aspect of sustainable development in micro-, small-, and medium-sized enterprises	2016	Desalination and Water Treatment
A. Marwan	Micro, small and medium enterprises (MSMEs) and creative industry development: Case study of Ternate City, Indonesia	2019	International Journal of Innovation, Creativity and Change
E. Saraswati	Materiality analysis and csr in micro, small, and medium enterprises	2021	International Symposia in Economic Theory and Econometrics
C. López-Mateo	Market structure and corporate social responsibility in Mexican micro, small and medium enterprises. The link between individual and social preferences	2017	Revista Brasileira de Marketing
S. Indarti	The effects of entrepreneurial Attitudes Mediation on the relationship between education and Training and management supervision on business growth in Riau, Indonesia	2017	International Journal of Economic Research

## 4.2 Discussion

### 4.2.1 CSR implementation strategies differ among MSMEs in the manufacturing and service sectors

CSR implementation strategies for MSMEs in the manufacturing and service sectors (Perrini *et al.*, 2007) may differ because of each sector's unique characteristics (Daszyńska-ęygadło *et al.*, 2016), the operating environment (Nguyen *et al.*, 2018), and challenges (Jatmiko, 2021). The following are some of the differences that may arise in CSR implementation strategies (Husted, 2007) (Aguilar, 2019) between the two sectors in terms of the type of product and service MSMEs in the manufacturing sector generally produce physical goods (Önüt and Soner, 2007) (Faller and Feldmüller, 2015). Their CSR strategy may focus more on reducing the environmental impact of production (Chakraborty, 2022; Luetkenhorst, 2004), such as using environmentally friendly raw materials and waste management (Nandy *et al.*, 2022; Wielgórka, 2016). MSMEs in the service sector focus on service delivery (López-Mateo, 2017; Zehrer, 2009). Their CSR strategy may be oriented towards training employees (Husted, 2007), creating an inclusive work environment (Achi, 2022), or contributing to the local community (Marwan, 2019).

In terms of environmental impact (Indarti, 2017), manufacturing MSMEs may need to consider reducing the environmental impact of their production processes (Hernández-Perlines, 2016), including waste management, more efficient use of energy (Achi, 2022; Berger, 2007), and adoption of green technologies (Stewart, 2018). MSMEs in the service sector may focus more on reducing the environmental impact of day-to-day operations (Park, 2015), such as reducing energy consumption in offices or adopting waste-reduction practices (Cowper-Smith and De Grosbois, 2011).

Regarding Supplier and Customer Engagement (Hampton *et al.*, 2022; Jatmiko, 2021), manufacturing MSMEs may have to collaborate with suppliers to ensure that the resources they use are environmentally friendly (Aguilar, 2019; Mafini and Loury-Okoumba, 2018). They also need to consider how customers value and repurpose their products (Bhinekawati, 2018; Lüdeke-Freund *et al.* 2019). MSMEs in the service sector may be more engaged with customers in terms of providing information about the social and environmental responsibility of their businesses (Aguilar, 2019; Jenkins, 2006).

In terms of the scale of operations, manufacturing MSMEs may face challenges in dealing with larger-scale operations, such as managing supply chains and logistics. MSMEs in the service sector may be more flexible in adapting their CSR practices to smaller-scale operations. In terms of Product Sustainability, manufacturing MSMEs may need to consider the lifecycle of their products and how to reduce the impact of the product after customers use it. MSMEs in the service sector may focus on long-term service quality and continuous interaction with customers.

The local factors include manufacturing. MSMEs may have challenges managing local raw materials, water use, or environmental issues. MSMEs in the service sector may be more connected to local communities and can participate more easily in local social initiatives.

### 4.2.2 Internal and external factors that influence the successful Implementation of CSR practices in MSMEs

The successful Implementation of Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) practices in micro-, small-, and medium-sized enterprises (MSMEs) can be influenced by several internal and external factors (Garriga, 2004; Indris and Primiana, 2015). Factors that may

affect the successful Implementation of CSR practices in MSMEs include (Kechiche and Soparnot, 2012; Marwan, 2019) (1) Internal Factors consist of Strong leadership and commitment of MSME owners to social and environmental values will affect the extent to which CSR is implemented effectively (Irawan, 2022; Vives, 2022), Awareness of the importance of social and environmental responsibility and corporate values that support CSR can encourage the Implementation of CSR practices, Availability Availability of human, financial, and technological resources will affect the capacity of MSMEs to implement CSR practices, Managerial ability to plan, implement, and manage CSR practices, The Availability Availability of human, financial, and technological resources will affect the capacity of MSMEs to implement CSR practices, Managerial capability in planning, executing, and measuring the impact of CSR practices will contribute to successful Implementation, Organizational culture that supports collaboration, openness, and concern for society and the environment will encourage the Implementation of CSR and Organizational structure that is flexible and collaborative can facilitate the Implementation of CSR practices.

External factors include demand from customers, employees, suppliers, local communities, and regulators, which can influence MSMEs' decisions to adopt CSR practices (Ciliberti, 2008); government regulations related to social and environmental responsibility can encourage or force MSMEs to implement CSR (Amaeshi, 2008; Williamson, 2006); interaction with local communities and the impact that MSMEs have on the community can affect the image (Aguilar, 2019; Biondi *et al.*, 2000); reputation of the business and consumers who are increasingly concerned about social and environmental issues can encourage MSMEs to implement CSR practices (Le, 2022); access to training, financial support, and CSR networks can assist MSMEs in implementing CSR practices; and business and industry associations can provide guidelines, standards, and approval in implementing CSR practices and monitoring by civil society and media coverage of social and environmental responsibility can influence MSME decisions.

#### 4.2.3 Positive and negative impacts of CSR practices on the brand image and reputation of MSMEs

Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) practices can positively (Esen, 2013) and negatively (Yoon *et al.*, 2006) impact the brand image and reputation of Micro, Small, and Medium Enterprises (MSMEs). (1) Positive Impacts include consistent CSR implementation, which can improve the brand image of MSMEs in the eyes of consumers (Yusuf *et al.*, 2018; Yusuf *et al.*, 2022). Individuals are more likely to support businesses that contribute to the environment and society (Lii *et al.* 2013). CSR practices that are meaningful and have a positive impact can build a good reputation for MSMEs (Le 2022). This can increase consumer confidence and differentiate businesses from competitors (Jatmiko, 2021; Moravcikova *et al.*, 2017). Consumers who care about social and environmental responsibilities tend to support MSMEs with strong CSR practices (Aguilar, 2019; Vives, 2022), resulting in increased sales and customer loyalty (Lee *et al.*, 2003). CSR practices can strengthen relationships with employees, customers, suppliers, and local communities, all of which can contribute to a positive image. Successful CSR practices can be used as inspirational stories that can capture media and public attention, helping build a unique narrative for the MSME brand.

Negative Impacts consisting of CSR practices that are inconsistent or only used as marketing tools without real impact can result in impaired credibility (Lin *et al.*, 2016) and create a negative impact on brand image (Kim *et al.*, 2020). Claiming positive effects that cannot be proven or accurately measured can harm brand image if these promises are



not fulfilled, CSR practices that are considered controversial or inconsistent with brand values or social responsibility can harm reputation, and the Implementation of CSR practices that are expensive or inefficient can negatively impact the financial health of MSMEs. If CSR practices are perceived as manipulative attempts to divert attention from the main problem, this can harm brand image.

#### 4.2.4 The effect of CSR practices on financial performance and growth of MSMEs

The effect of Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) practices on the financial performance and growth of Micro, Small, and Medium Enterprises (MSMEs) can vary depending on a variety of factors (Hernández, 2020), including the type of CSR practices implemented, business objectives, industry, and operating environment that have an influence, namely (1) Positive Influence including: Implementation of good CSR practices can provide a competitive advantage by differentiating MSMEs from competitors (Yusuf *et al.*, 2022) and attracting consumers who are more concerned about social and environmental responsibility, Consumers tend to be more loyal to businesses that have positive CSR practices (Fatma *et al.*, 2018), which can result in a growing customer base, Successful CSR practices can improve the brand image of MSMEs, which can have a positive impact on the perceived value of the product or service and higher prices, CSR practices that focus on local communities can strengthen relationships with relevant parties, including government, community, and non-profit organizations, which can provide financial support or Access to new opportunities, and Some markets or customers may expect MSMEs to have positive CSR practices, so implementing these practices can open doors to a wider market.

The Negative Influences include the implementation of intensive or complex CSR practices that may result in additional costs for MSMEs (Szczanowicz and Saniuk, 2016), which may affect profitability; focus on specific CSR practices may divert resources from other growth initiatives, which may slow business growth; MSMEs may face resource limitations to implement significant CSR practices, which may hinder development; some consumers may not be affected by CSR practices and focus more on the value of the product or service; If CSR practices are perceived as controversial or incompatible with brand values, this may be detrimental to reputation and performance.

#### 4.2.5 MSME owners' involvement in social and environmental activities has an impact on business sustainability

The involvement of Micro, Small, and Medium Enterprise (MSME) owners in social and environmental activities can have a positive impact on business sustainability (Achi, 2022) This engagement may include direct participation in local social, environmental, or community initiatives (Supanti *et al.*, 2015). Some of the ways MSME owners' engagement in social and environmental activities can contribute to business sustainability (Famiola and Wulansari, 2020) include (1) MSME owners' engagement in positive social and environmental activities can enhance the brand image and reputation of the business. This can help differentiate MSMEs from competitors, attract caring consumers, and build trust (Jenkins 2006; López-Pérez *et al.* 2017). (2) Consumers tend to be more loyal to businesses active in social and environmental activities that match their values. This can result in more stable growth of the customer base (Pirsch *et al.*, 2007). (3) Involvement in social and environmental activities can strengthen relationships with employees, customers, suppliers and local communities. This could create valuable networks for support and collaboration. (4) MSME owners' involvement in social and environmental communities can open doors to new business opportunities, such as partnerships with non-profit organizations or participation in government programs. (5)

Involvement in positive social and environmental activities can improve a business's image in the eyes of the government and regulators, leading to regulatory support and leniency. (6) Owner involvement in social and environmental activities demonstrates real responsibility towards social and environmental issues, which can strengthen ties with communities and customers.

#### 4.2.5 The role of government support in encouraging the Implementation of CSR practices in MSMEs

Government support plays a vital role in encouraging the implementation of Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) practices in Micro, Small and Medium Enterprises (MSMEs) (Johnson, 2015). This support includes policies, incentives, guidelines, and programs that encourage MSMEs to adopt CSR practices. The concrete role of government support in encouraging the Implementation of CSR practices in MSMEs includes creating policies and regulations. Governments can develop standards or guidelines on CSR practices relevant to MSMEs (Pastrana and Sriramesh, 2014), assisting MSMEs in understanding and implementing such practices. Second, the Provision of Information and Resources (Gamerschlag *et al.*, 2011): the government can provide educational materials and training on CSR to MSMEs, helping them understand the benefits and implementation methods of CSR practices (Wang *et al.*, 2020), and the government can provide access to resources such as financial assistance, training, and consulting to assist MSMEs in developing and running CSR programs. Third, Incentives and Awards: The government can provide tax incentives or financial support to MSMEs that implement positive CSR practices, and the government can provide awards or certifications to MSMEs that successfully adopt CSR practices that have a positive impact. Fourth, Empowerment Through Partnerships: The government may form partnerships between MSMEs and non-profit organizations, research institutions, or educational institutions to assist MSMEs in implementing CSR practices. Fifth, Reporting and Monitoring: The government can encourage MSMEs to report their CSR practices transparently, helping improve accountability and transparency.

Research conducted by Syaraswati and Setiany (2022) on companies with family ownership and export orientation concluded that companies with political connections will prepare more intensive CSR disclosures in their financial reporting because they wipe out customer fretfulness about the sustainability of a company with family ownership.

#### 4.2.6. CSR Support for MSMEs

To achieve its mentoring objectives, Bank A employed various approaches, including Funding Provision, Business Equipment, Education & Training, Accessibility, and Marketing. At Bank A, in terms of funding, all assistance provided is in the form of grants, requiring no repayment from MSMEs. In terms of quantity, Bank A's assistance is relatively larger than that of Bank B, with some beneficiaries receiving up to Rp 300 million, although the amount varies among MSMEs. Similarly, Bank B provides grants without requiring repayment. Each MSME received a grant of Rp 30 million from Bank B.

Regarding business equipment, Bank A is more advantageous than Bank B as well as other involved entities. All MSMEs assisted by Bank A receive business equipment according to the proposals submitted, ensuring the equipment's suitability and necessity. Bank B also provides equipment support, but not all MSMEs allocate their grants for this purpose, as equipment needs are not always a priority. However, equipment is an effective form of assistance as it directly enhances MSME productivity.

Bank A is more advanced than Bank B in offering training needs and covering production, marketing, and financial recording. These trainings involve partners such as banks or academicians. In contrast, Bank B's training focuses only on project execution, such as project management and design thinking, which is seen as insufficient in intensity and content for MSMEs, as Bank B does not assess training needs. There is also a lack of training in technical business skills.

Bank A does not have specific limitations in selecting MSMEs for mentorship except for geographical area limitations. The registration process for this mentorship is closed, usually with Bank A's regional branches having specific preferences and directly appointing the participants. Conversely, Bank B's project is accessible to anyone with any type of business. However, owing to funding limitations, the number of MSMEs that can be mentored is very limited. Registration for this mentorship is open, meaning that anyone can apply. The operational funding needs are still low, so the primary need is easy and affordable loan accessibility with a fast process.

Bank A provides marketing support to all mentored MSMEs, including product exhibitions and assistance in setting up the marketing galleries. For Bank B, marketing support is part of the assistance curriculum. Bank A also helps sell products through its network. At Bank B, only one out of three MSMEs allocated funds for gallery creation, which was partly funded by other donor institutions. These galleries also serve as houses for production.

#### 4.2.7. Performance of Sustainable MSMEs

The impact of CSR by donor institutions on MSME sustainability can be viewed in three dimensions: social, environmental, and business. The analysis was performed as follows.

Bank A's initial project spirit was community empowerment, which focused on aspects such as training, recruitment, and participant evaluation. Although Bank B showed a similar approach, one area that lacked social enthusiasm resulted in poor performance, especially in production and community engagement.

At Bank A, mentors and the community largely overlooked environmental concerns, as the project did not initially emphasize environmental aspects. Only about two MSME owners were environmentally conscious, a realization that predated their mentorship. A similar situation was observed in Bank B, where environmental sustainability was not highlighted. However, one area showed significant environmental concern, stemming from the personal awareness of the mentor rather than the donor institution.

At Bank A, as the project is still in its early stages, a significant business impact on MSMEs is not yet evident. Only to 2-3 out of the four mentored MSMEs have shown positive business dimensions, albeit on a small scale.

At Bank B, only one involved MSME displayed a positive business impact, which existed even before mentorship. As mentioned previously, this study is relevant to SDGs 1 and 8. Post-research, an analysis of its correlation with the findings was conducted.

Table 4: Correlation with SDGs

Standard	Bank A	Bank B
SDGs 1 No Poverty (1.1)	Targets economically vulnerable subsistence communities to improve income	Shares the same spirit, with an economic improvement in the community observed in the first year

Standard	Bank A	Bank B
SDGs 8 Decent Work and Economic Growth (8.3)	Comprehensive business development training and enhanced access to banking products	Limited to business development training, focusing only on specific parts

Source: Analyzed from UN (2023)

## 5. CONCLUSION

Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) practices play a crucial role in encouraging sustainability and social responsibility among micro, small, and medium-sized enterprises (MSMEs). A literature review and in-depth analysis revealed the importance of CSR for MSMEs, the positive impact of CSR practices, challenges and risks, the role of external support, industry and sector context, and business sustainability.

In a global context that is becoming increasingly aware of social and environmental responsibility, MSMEs have the opportunity to become agents of positive change in society. The Implementation of CSR practices, if performed well, can provide significant long-term benefits to MSMEs and their surrounding communities. However, it is essential to understand the business context and consider the impact of the decisions made to achieve social, environmental, and economic goals. The research found that there is a considerable range of assistance provided to MSMEs, including ease of registration, equipment support, and training assistance. Within this scope, some forms of assistance are effective, while others are not, with effective findings such as marketing, training, and mentoring. It was also discovered that sustainability performance in this domain is measured through social dimensions, environmental dimensions, and ultimately through business dimensions. This is because a business is considered futile if it operates without a sound business model.

Despite these limitations, research on CSR practices in MSMEs has essential value in providing insights into how MSMEs can contribute to social and environmental responsibility more broadly, and how they can overcome barriers and optimize the positive impact of these practices.

Research on the implementation of Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) practices in Micro, Small, and Medium Enterprises (MSMEs) has important theoretical and practical implications. This research contributes to the development of a more in-depth theory of how MSMEs can adopt and implement CSR practices in a unique context. It can enrich our understanding of the social and environmental responsibilities of MSMEs and provide practical guidance for MSMEs in planning, implementing, and measuring the impact of CSR practices. These guidelines can help MSMEs avoid barriers and capitalize on emerging opportunities.

Future research should expand the literature review to compare CSR practices in MSMEs across different sectors, not only the manufacturing and service sectors. This can provide deeper insight into the differences and similarities in CSR implementation among different sectors. Examining the impact of CSR in more detail, in terms of both economic, social, and environmental factors, can help identify the concrete benefits obtained by MSMEs and related stakeholders. Research on how technology and innovation can be used in CSR implementation in MSMEs, such as the use of green technology or digital-based platforms to engage consumers, is an exciting area of research.

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

We thank the anonymous reviewers for their helpful comments and recommendations.

## REFERENCES

- [1] Achi, A. (2022), “CSR and green process innovation as antecedents of micro, small, and medium enterprise performance: The moderating role of perceived environmental volatility”, *Journal of Business Research*, Vol. 139, pp. 771–781, doi: 10.1016/j.jbusres.2021.10.016.
- [2] Aguilar, J.L.E. (2019), “Practices of corporate social responsibility developed by Mexican family businesses and their impact on competitive success and innovation,” *Tec Empresarial*, Vol. 13 No. 2, pp. 45–57, doi: 10.18845/te.v13i2.4494.
- [3] Amaechi, K.M. (2008), “Corporate social responsibility in supply chains of global brands: A boundaryless responsibility? Clarifications, exceptions, and implications”, *Journal of Business Ethics*, doi: 10.1007/s10551-007-9490-5.
- [4] Berger, I.E. (2007), “Mainstreaming corporate social responsibility: Developing markets for virtue” *California Management Review*, Vol. 49 No. 4, pp. 132–157, doi: 10.2307/41166409.
- [5] Bhinekawati, R. (2018), “The Linkages Between CSR, Social Capital, and Small Enterprise Development in a Large Company’s Supply Chain”, *Approaches to Global Sustainability, Markets, and Governance*, doi: 10.1007/978-981-10-5047-3\_10.
- [6] Biondi, V., Frey, M. and Iraldo, F. (2000), “Environmental management systems and SMEs: Motivations, opportunities and barriers related to EMAS and ISO 14001 implementation”, *Greener Management International*, JSTOR, No. 29, pp. 55–69.
- [7] Boateng, E., Amoako, S., Amoako, K., Acheampong, K. and Abraham, A. (2022), “The Role Impact of Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) In Building Small and Medium Enterprises (SMEs) Brand Image in Ghana”, *International Journal of Current Science Research and Review*, Vol. 5 No. 05.
- [8] Carroll, A.B. (2010), “The business case for corporate social responsibility: A review of concepts, research, and practice”, *International Journal of Management Reviews*, doi: 10.1111/j.1468-2370.2009.00275.x.
- [9] Chakraborty, M. (2022), “Impact of CSR in Brand Equity as a Marketing Tool: A Study on Registered Medium Enterprises of Consumer Durables in Kolkata, West Bengal”, *Contributions to Management Science*, doi: 10.1007/978-3-030-89416-0\_5.
- [10] Ciliberti, F. (2008), “Investigating corporate social responsibility in supply chains: an SME perspective”, *Journal of Cleaner Production*, Vol. 16 No. 15, pp. 1579–1588, doi: 10.1016/j.jclepro.2008.04.016.
- [11] Cowper-Smith, A., De Grosbois, D. (2011), “The adoption of corporate social responsibility practices in the airline industry”, *Journal of Sustainable Tourism*, Taylor & Francis, Vol. 19 No. 1, pp. 59–77.
- [12] Daszyńska-Żygadło, K., Słowski, T. and Zawadzki, B. (2016), “The market value of CSR performance across sectors”, *Inżynierine Ekonomika-Engineering Economics*, Vol. 27 No. 2.
- [13] van Dinter, R., Tekinerdogan, B. and Catal, C. (2021), “Automation of systematic

- literature reviews: A systematic literature review” *Information and Software Technology*, Vol. 136, p. 106589.
- [14] El Alfy, A., Palaschuk, N., El-Bassiouny, D., Wilson, J. and Weber, O. (2020), “Scoping the evolution of corporate social responsibility (CSR) research in the sustainable development goals (SDGs) era”, *Sustainability*, MDPI, Vol. 12 No. 14, p. 5544.
- [15] Esen, E. (2013), “The influence of corporate social responsibility (CSR) activities on building corporate reputation”, *International Business, Sustainability and Corporate Social Responsibility*, Emerald Group Publishing Limited, pp. 133–150.
- [16] Esubalew, A.A., Raghurama, A. (2017), “Revisiting the global definitions of MSMEs: parametric and standardization issues”, *Asian Journal of Research in Business Economics and Management*, Asian Research Consortium, Vol. 7 No. 8, pp. 429–440.
- [17] Faisal, M.N. (2009), “Benchmarking supply chains on risk dimensions”, *International Journal of Services and Operations Management*, Inderscience Publishers, Vol. 5 No. 3, pp. 402–427.
- [18] Faller, C. and Feldmüller, D. (2015), “Industry 4.0 learning factory for regional SMEs”, *Procedia Cirp*, Elsevier, Vol. 32, pp. 88–91.
- [19] Fabiola, M., Wulansari, A. (2020), “SMEs’ social and environmental initiatives in Indonesia: an institutional and resource-based analysis”, *Social Responsibility Journal*, Emerald Publishing Limited, Vol. 16 No. 1, pp. 15–27.
- [20] Fatma, M., Khan, I. and Rahman, Z. (2018), “CSR and consumer behavioral responses: The role of customer-company identification”, *Asia Pacific Journal of Marketing and Logistics*, Emerald Publishing Limited, Vol. 30 No. 2, pp. 460–477.
- [21] Gamerschlag, R., Möller, K. and Verbeeten, F. (2011), “Determinants of voluntary CSR disclosure: empirical evidence from Germany”, *Review of Managerial Science*, Springer, Vol. 5, pp. 233–262.
- [22] Garriga, E. (2004), “Corporate social responsibility theories: Mapping the territory”, *Journal of Business Ethics*, doi: 10.1023/B:BUSI.0000039399.90587.34.
- [23] Hadi, N.; Udin, U. (2021). Testing the Effectiveness of CSR Dimensions for Small Business Entrepreneurs. *J. Open Innov. Technol. Mark. Complex.* 7, 6. <https://doi.org/10.3390/joitmc7010006>
- [24] Hampton, H., Foley, A., Del Rio, D.F., Smyth, B., Lavery, D. and Caulfield, B. (2022), “Customer engagement strategies in retail electricity markets: A comprehensive and comparative review”, *Energy Research & Social Science*, Elsevier, Vol. 90, p. 102611.
- [25] Hernández-Perlines, F. (2016), “Analysis of the effect of corporate social responsibility in the business results of micro, small and medium-sized enterprises (MSMEs)”, *Journal Globalization, Competitiveness, and Governability*, Vol. 10 No. 1, pp. 110–123, doi: 10.3232/GCG.2016.V10.N1.06.
- [26] Hernández, J.P.S.-I. (2020), “Moderating effect of firm size on the influence of corporate social responsibility in the economic performance of micro-, small- and medium-sized enterprises”, *Technological Forecasting and Social Change*, Vol. 151, doi: 10.1016/j.techfore.2019.119774.
- [27] Husted, B. (2007), “Strategic Corporate Social Responsibility and Value Creation among Large Firms. Lessons from the Spanish Experience”, *Long Range Planning*, Vol. 40 No. 6, pp. 594–610, doi: 10.1016/j.lrp.2007.07.001.

- [28] Ibrahim, S., Jamali, D. and Karatas-Ozkan, M. (2012), "Corporate social responsibility (CSR) in Small and Medium-Sized Enterprises: A developing country perspective", *Social and Sustainable Enterprise: Changing the Nature of Business*, Emerald Group Publishing Limited, pp. 167–192.
- [29] Indarti, S. (2017), "The effects of entrepreneurial attitudes mediation on the relationship between education and training and management supervision on business growth in Riau, Indonesia", *International Journal of Economic Research*, Vol. 14 No. 2, pp. 53–60.
- [30] Indris, S., Primiana, I. (2015), "Internal and external environment analysis on the performance of small and medium industries SMEs in Indonesia", *International Journal of Scientific & Technology Research*, Vol. 4 No. 4, pp. 188–196.
- [31] Irawan, E.P. (2022), "A Review on Digitalization of CSR during the COVID-19 Pandemic in Indonesia: Opportunities and Challenges", *Social Sciences*, doi: 10.3390/socsci11020072.
- [32] Jatmiko, B. (2021), "Strategies for MSMEs to Achieve Sustainable Competitive Advantage: The SWOT Analysis Method", *Journal of Asian Finance, Economics, and Business*, Vol. 8 No. 3, pp. 505–515, doi: 10.13106/jafeb.2021.vol8.no3.0505.
- [33] Jenkins, H. (2006), "Small business champions for corporate social responsibility", *Journal of Business Ethics*, Springer, Vol. 67, pp. 241–256.
- [34] Johnson, M.P. (2015), "Sustainability Management and Small and Medium-Sized Enterprises: Managers' Awareness and Implementation of Innovative Tools", *Corporate Social Responsibility and Environmental Management*, Vol. 22 No. 5, pp. 271–285, doi: 10.1002/csr.1343.
- [35] Kechiche, A., and Soparnot, R. (2012), "CSR within SMEs: A literature review" *International Business Research*, Citeseer, Vol. 5 No. 7, p. 97.
- [36] Kim, M., Yin, X. and Lee, G. (2020), "The effect of CSR on corporate image, customer citizenship behaviors, and customers' long-term relationship orientation", *International Journal of Hospitality Management*, Elsevier, Vol. 88, p. 102520.
- [37] Knight, G.A., Liesch, P.W. (2016), "Unk Internationalization: From incremental to born global", *Journal of World Business*, Elsevier, Vol. 51 No. 1, pp. 93–102.
- [38] Kossovsky, C.L.. R.A.N.D.N.I.R. (2013), "Intangibles and The New Reality: Risk, Reputation and Value Creation" *Islamic Economic Studies*.
- [39] Kumar, T. (2017). The linkage between CSR & corporate reputation: evidence from public & private corporations in Bangladesh. *Review of Integrative Business and Economics Research*, 7.
- [40] Le, T.T. (2022), "Corporate social responsibility and SMEs' performance: the mediating role of corporate image, corporate reputation, and customer loyalty", *International Journal of Emerging Markets*, Emerald Publishing Limited.
- [41] Lee, S.-C., Barker, S. and Kandampully, J. (2003), "Technology, service quality, and customer loyalty in hotels: Australian managerial perspectives," *Managing Service Quality: An International Journal*, MCB UP Ltd, Vol. 13 No. 5, pp. 423–432.
- [42] Lii, Y.-S., Wu, K.-W. and Ding, M.-C. (2013), "Doing good does good?" Sustainable Marketing of CSR and Consumer Evaluations," *Corporate Social Responsibility and Environmental Management*, Wiley Online Library, Vol. 20 No. 1, pp. 15–28.
- [43] Lin, H., Zeng, S., Wang, L., Zou, H. and Ma, H. (2016), "How does environmental irresponsibility impair corporate reputation? A multi-method investigation",

- Corporate Social Responsibility and Environmental Management*, Wiley Online Library, Vol. 23 No. 6, pp. 413–423.
- [44] Lindgreen, A., Swaen, V. and Maon, F. (2009), “Introduction: Corporate social responsibility implementation”, *Journal of Business Ethics*, Springer, Vol. 85, pp. 251–256.
- [45] López-Mateo, C. (2017), “Market structure and corporate social responsibility in Mexican micro-, small-, and medium-sized enterprises. The link between individual and social preferences. *Revista Brasileira de Marketing*, Vol. 16 No. 3, pp. 410–425, doi: 10.5585/remark.v16i3.3347.
- [46] López-Pérez, M., Melero, I., and Javier Sese, F. (2017), “Management for sustainable development and its impact on firm value in the SME context: Does size matter?” *Business Strategy and the Environment*. Wiley Online Library, Vol. 26 No. 7, pp. 985–999.
- [47] Lüdeke-Freund, F., Gold, S. and Bocken, N.M.P. (2019), “A review and typology of circular economy business model patterns,” *Journal of Industrial Ecology*, Wiley Online Library, Vol. 23 No. 1, pp. 36–61.
- [48] Luetkenhorst, W. (2004), “Corporate social responsibility and the development agenda - The case for actively involving small and medium enterprises,” *Intereconomics*, Vol. 39 No. 3, pp. 157–166, doi: 10.1007/BF02933583.
- [49] Mafini, C. and Loury-Okoumba, W. V. (2018), “Extending green supply chain management activities to manufacturing small and medium enterprises in a developing economy”, *South African Journal of Economic and Management Sciences*, AOSIS, Vol. 21 No. 1, pp. 1–12.
- [50] Marwan, A. (2019), “Micro, small and medium enterprises (MSME) and creative industry development: A case study of Ternate City, Indonesia”, *International Journal of Innovation, Creativity, and Change*, Vol. 8 No. 4, pp. 114–127.
- [51] Mendibil, K., Hernandez, J., Espinach, X., Garriga, E. and Macgregor, S. (2007), “How can CSR practices lead to successful innovation in SMEs”, *Publication from the RESPONSE Project*, pp. 1–7.
- [52] Montecchi, M., Plangger, K. and West, D.C. (2021), “Supply chain transparency: A bibliometric review and research agenda”, *International Journal of Production Economics*, Elsevier, Vol. 238, p. 108152.
- [53] Moravcikova, D., Krizanova, A., Kliestikova, J. and Rypakova, M. (2017), “Green Marketing as the Source of the Competitive Advantage of the Business”, *Sustainability*, MDPI, Vol. 9 No. 12, p. 2218.
- [54] Nair, N.K. and Sodhi, J.S. (2012), “CSR practices by SMEs in India: Lessons from five case studies,” *Indian Journal of Industrial Relations*, JSTOR, pp. 583–597.
- [55] Nandy, S., Fortunato, E. and Martins, R. (2022), “Green economy and waste management: An inevitable plan for materials science”, *Progress in Natural Science: Materials International*, Elsevier, Vol. 32 No. 1, pp. 1–9.
- [56] Nguyen, M., Bensemann, J. and Kelly, S. (2018), “Corporate social responsibility (CSR) in Vietnam: a conceptual framework”, *International Journal of Corporate Social Responsibility*, Springer, Vol. 3, pp. 1–12.
- [57] Önüt, S. and Soner, S. (2007), “Analysis of energy use and efficiency in Turkish manufacturing sector SMEs”, *Energy Conversion and Management*, Elsevier, Vol. 48 No. 2, pp. 384–394.
- [58] Palupi, A. (2023), “Does CSR Affects Earnings Announcements?” *Review of Integrative Business and Economics Research*, Vol. 1 No. 1, pp. 205-215.



- [59] Park, B. (2015), “Determinants influencing CSR practices in small and medium-sized MNE subsidiaries: A stakeholder perspective”, *Journal of World Business*, Vol. 50 No. 1, pp. 192–204, doi: 10.1016/j.jwb.2014.04.007.
- [60] Pastrana, N.A. and Sriramesh, K. (2014), “Corporate social responsibility: Perceptions and practices among SMEs in Colombia”, *Public Relations Review*, Elsevier, Vol. 40 No. 1, pp. 14–24.
- [61] Pelozo, J. and Falkenberg, L. (2009), “The role of collaboration in achieving corporate social responsibility objectives”, *California Management Review*, SAGE Publications Sage CA: Los Angeles, CA, Vol. 51 No. 3, pp. 95–113.
- [62] Perrini, F., Russo, A. and Tencati, A. (2007), “CSR strategies of SMEs and large firms. Evidence from Italy”, *Journal of Business Ethics*, Springer, Vol. 74, pp. 285–300.
- [63] Pirsch, J., Gupta, S., Grau, S. L. (2007), “A framework for understanding corporate social responsibility programs as a continuum: An exploratory study”, *Journal of Business Ethics*, Springer, Vol. 70, pp. 125–140.
- [64] Russo, A. and Tencati, A. (2009), “Formal vs. informal CSR strategies: Evidence from Italian micro, small, medium-sized, and large firms”, *Journal of Business Ethics*, Springer, Vol. 85, pp. 339–353.
- [65] Shah, A. B., Nasir, K., and Niazi, K.G.S. (2020), “Effects of Corporate Social Responsibility on Financial Performance of Islamic Banks in Pakistan,” *International Review of Management and Business Research*, Vol. 9 No. 2, doi: 10.30543/9-2(2020)-6.
- [66] Soedarsa, H. G. (2019). Implementation of corporate social responsibility and public welfare improvement: a study in Indonesia. *Review of Integrative Business and Economics Research*, 8, 144.
- [67] Spence, L.J., Frynas, J.G., Muthuri, J.N. and Navarre, J. (2018), *Research Handbook on Small Business Social Responsibility: Global Perspectives*, Edward Elgar Publishing.
- [68] Stewart, R. (2018), “Circular economy in corporate sustainability strategies: A review of corporate sustainability reports in the fast-moving consumer goods sector”, *Business Strategy and the Environment*, Vol. 27 No. 7, pp. 1005–1022, doi: 10.1002/bse.2048.
- [69] Suhardjanto, D., Fitriyana, F. R., Wedaswari, M., & Wahyuningtyas, A. A. (2017). Stakeholder and corporate social responsibility disclosure: A comparative study of Indonesia, India, and Pakistan. *Review of Integrative Business and Economics Research*, 6, 92.
- [70] Suminah, S., Suwanto, S., Sugihardjo, S., Anantanyu, S. and Padmaningrum, D. (2022), “Determinants of micro, small, and medium-scale enterprise performers’ income during the Covid-19 pandemic era”, *Heliyon*, Elsevier, Vol. 8 No. 7.
- [71] Supanti, D., Butcher, K. and Fredline, L. (2015), “Enhancing the employer-employee relationship through corporate social responsibility (CSR) engagement”, *International Journal of Contemporary Hospitality Management*, Emerald Group Publishing Limited, Vol. 27 No. 7, pp. 1479–1498.
- [72] Syaraswati, D., Setiyani, E. (2022), “Political Connection, Family Ownership, Board Commissioners and Market Orientation on the Corporate Social Responsibility Disclosure”, *Review of Integrative Business and Economics Research*, Vol. 11 No. 3, pp. 135-144.
- [73] Szczanowicz, J. and Saniuk, S. (2016), “Evaluation and reporting of CSR in SME

- sector”, *Management*, De Gruyter Poland, Vol. 20 No. 1, p. 96.
- [74] Vives, A. (2022), “Social and environmental responsibility in small and medium enterprises in Latin America”, *Corporate Citizenship in Latin America: New Challenges for Business*, Routledge, pp. 39–50.
- [75] Wang, Y., Xiong, M. and Olya, H. (2020), “Toward an understanding of responsible artificial intelligence practices”, *Proceedings of the 53rd Hawaii International Conference on System Sciences*, pp. 4962–4971.
- [76] Wielgórka, D. (2016), “Environmental management in the aspect of sustainable development in micro-, small-, and medium-sized enterprises”, *Desalination and Water Treatment*, Vol. 57 No. 3, pp. 982–992, doi: 10.1080/19443994.2015.1017322.
- [77] Williamson, D. (2006), “Drivers of environmental behavior in manufacturing SMEs and the implications for CSR”, *Journal of Business Ethics*, doi: 10.1007/s10551-006-9187-1.
- [78] Yoon, Y., Gürhan-Canli, Z. and Schwarz, N. (2006), “The effect of corporate social responsibility (CSR) activities on companies with bad reputations”, *Journal of Consumer Psychology*, Elsevier, Vol. 16 No. 4, pp. 377–390.
- [79] Ben Youssef, K., Leicht, T., Pellicelli, M. and Kitchen, P.J. (2018), “The importance of corporate social responsibility (CSR) for branding and business success in small and medium-sized enterprises (SME) in a business-to-distributor (B2D) context”, *Journal of Strategic Marketing*, Taylor & Francis, Vol. 26 No. 8, pp. 723–739.
- [80] Yusuf, M., Surya, B., Menne, F., Ruslan, M., Suriani, S. and Iskandar, I. (2022), “Business Agility and Competitive Advantage of SMEs in Makassar City, Indonesia”, *Sustainability*, MDPI, Vol. 15 No. 1, p. 627.
- [81] Zaridis, A.D. and Mousiolis, D.T. (2014), “Entrepreneurship and SME’s organizational structure. Elements of a successful business”, *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences*, Elsevier, Vol. 148, pp. 463–467.
- [82] Zehrer, A. (2009), “Service experience and service design: concepts and application in tourism SMEs”, *Managing Service Quality: An International Journal*, Emerald Group